

CHART
of
PRIVY COUNCIL DECISIONS
with reference to
THE BRITISH NORTH AMERICA ACT

W. R. JACKETT

PRIVY COUNCIL
WITH REFERENCE
THE BRITISH NO.
PAGE

		(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	SECTION 91												SECTION 92																
		a	1	2	3	7	9	10	12	15	21	22	23	24	25	26	27	29	b	1	2	4	5	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	1	3
Cuvillier v. Aylwin	1832	2	Knapp	72	I	198																													
In re Marois	1862	15	Moo.	P.C. 189	I	202	Chelmsford																												
Reg. v. Coote	1873	L.R. 4	P.C. 599	I		Collier																													
L'Union St.Jacques v. Belisle	1874	L.R. 6	P.C. 31	I	206	Selborne																													
Dow v. Black	1875	L.R. 6	P.C. 272	I	212	Colvile																													
Quebec v. Queen Insce.Co.	1878	3	1090	I	222	Jessel																													
Valin v. Langlois	1879	5	115	I	247	Selborne																													
Cushing v. Dupuy	1880	5	409	I	253	Smith																													
Bourgoin v. Montreal Rwy. Co.	1880	5	404			Colvile																													
Citizens Insce.Co. v. Parsons	1881	7	96	I	267	Smith																													
Dobie v. Temporalities Board	1881	7	136	I	293	Watson																													
Russell v. The Queen	1882	7	829	I	310	Smith																													
Ontario v. Mercer	1883	8	767	I	322	Selborne																													
Hodge v. The Queen	1883	9	117	I	333	Fitzgerald																													
Colonial Bldg.Ass. v. Quebec	1883	9	157	I	349	Smith																													
Quebec v. Reed	1884	10	141	I	360	Selborne																													
Bank of Toronto v. Lambe	1887	12	575	I	378	Hobhouse																													
St.Catharine's Milling Co.v. R.	1888	14	46	I	390	Watson																													
British Columbia v. Canada	1888	14	295	I	403	Watson																													
Maritime Bank v. Receiver General	1892		437	I	414	Watson																													
Winnipeg v. Barrett	1892		445	I	421	Macnaghten																													
Tenant v. Union Bank of Canada	1894		31	I	433	Watson																													
Voluntary Assignments Case	1894		189	I	447	Herschell																													
Brophy v. Manitoba	1895		202	I	457	Herschell																													
Ontario Liquor License Case	1896		348	I	481	Watson																													
Esquimalt v.Nanaimo Rly. v. Bainbridge	1896		561	I	501	Watson																													
Fielding v. Thomas	1896		600	I	506	Halsbury																													
Indian Annuities Case	1897		199	I	517	Watson																													
Brewers & Maltsters v. Ontario	1897		231	I	529	Herschell																													
Queen's Counsel Case	1898		247	I	535	Watson																													
Fisheries Case (Canada v. Ontario)	1898		700	I	542	Herschell																													
C.F.R. v.Bonsecours	1899		367	I	558	Watson																													
Union Colliery v. Bryden	1899		580	I	564	Watson																													
Madden v. Nelson & Fort Sheppard	1899		626	I	571	Halsbury																													
Manitoba v.Liquor Licence Holders	1902		73	I	574	Macnaghten																													
Lambe v. Manuel	1903		68	I	580	Macnaghten																													
Ontario Mining Co. v. Seybold	1903		73	I	584	Davey																													
Cunningham v. Tomey Homma	1903		151	I	594	Halsbury																													
Ontario v. Hamilton Street Rly.	1903		524	I	600	Halsbury																													
P.E.I. v. Canada	1905		37	I	605	Wilson																													
Toronto v. Bell Telephone	1905		52	I	617	Macnaghten																													
British Columbia v. C.P.R.	1906		204	I	624	Wilson																													
Canada v. Cain	1906		542	I	631	Atkinson																													
Grand Trunk Rly. v. Canada	1907		65	I	636	Dunedin																													
Richelieu & Ontario Navigation Co.Case	1907		112	I	636	Barnes																													
McGregor v. Esquimalt Rly.	1907		462	I	647	Taschereau																													
Toronto v. C.P.R.	1908		54	I	653	Collins																													
Crown Grain Co. v. Day	1908		504	I	658	Robertson																													
Woodruff v. Ontario	1908		508	I	662	Collins																													
Watts v. Watts	1908		573	I	667	Collins																													
La Compagnie Hydraulique Case	1909		194	I	672	Wilson																													
Indian Annuities Case	1910		637	I	676	Loreburn																													
Burrard Power Co. v. R.	1911		87	I	685	Mersey																													

(1) - volume of appeal cases
(2) - page in appeal cases
(3) - Volume of Cameron's Cases
(4) - page in Cameron
(5) - person who delivered judgment
91-a - introductory words of s.91
91-b - concluding words of s.91
A - History & objects of B.N.A. Act
- Nature of legislative power
- Abuse of power
- Interference by Dominion with province or vice versa

B - B.N.A. Act exhaustive
- Territoriality
C - General rules re 91 & 92
D - Trenching
E - Ancillary or incidental legislation
- Double Aspect rule
- True nature of legislation
- Pith & Substance
- Possibility of future conflict

F	- Overlapping field - Dominion prevails - Concurrent legislation - Conflicting legislation - 'Reugnanc' or occupied field
G	- Delegated or Conditional leg.
H	- Parliament's interpretation
I	- Reference to 1867, history or extraneous circumstances
J	- References & academic questions

- Appeals to R.C. & leave to appeal
- Dominion Companies
- Provincial constitutions
- Applicability of laws of England or France
- Indirect attempts
- General rules of interpretation

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	SECTION 91												SECTION 92												O					
	a	1	2	3	6	8	10	12	15	24	25	26	27	29	b	1	2	5	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	9	12	14	15	16	56	58	6
Wyatt v. Quebec (Fishing rights)	1911	489	I	693	Macnaghten																														
The King v. Lovitt	1912	212	I	700	Robson																														
Montreal v. Montreal St.Rly.	1912	333	I	711	Atkinson																														
Ontario v. Canada (Companies Reference)	1912	571	I	723	Loreburn																														
Toronto & Niagara v. North Toronto	1912	834	I	740	Haldane																														
Marriage Reference	1912	880	I	749	Haldane																														
Royal Bank v. K.	1913	283	I	756	Haldane																														
B.C. v. Canada (Fishing)	1914	153	I	769	Haldane																														
Cotton v. K.	1914	176	I	788	Moulton																														
John Deere Plow v. Wharton	1915	330	I	806	Haldane																														
Alberta v. Canada	1915	36	I	818	Moulton																														
Insurance Reference	1916	1	588	II	63	Haldane																													
Companies Reference	1916	1	598	II	71	Haldane																													
Bonanza Creek v. K.	1916	1	566	II	75	Haldane																													
Hamilton G. & B.Ry. v. A.G. for Ont.	1916	2	583	II	93	Buckmaster																													
Smith v. Vermillion Hills	1916	2	569	II	97	Haldane																													
Ottawa Separate Schools v. Ottawa	1917	76	II	102	Buckmaster																														
Ottawa Separate Schools v. Mackell	1917	62	II	108	Buckmaster																														
A.G. for Canada v. Ritchie	1919	999	II	119	Dunedin																														
Walker v. Walker	1919	947	II	130	Haldane																														
Board v. Board	1919	956	II	124	Haldane																														
Toronto Gen'l Trusts v. K.	1919	956	II	136	Cave																														
Re Initiative & Referendum Act	1919	935	II	142	Haldane																														
Workmen's Compensation Board v.C.P.R.	1920	184	II	151	Haldane																														
Ottawa Separate Schools v.Que.Bank	1920	230	II	158	Dunedin																														
Toronto Ry. v. Toronto	1920	426	II	165	Finlay																														
Toronto Ry. v. Toronto	1920	446	II	179	Cave																														
Paquet v. Corp. of Pilots	1920	1029	II	186	Haldane																														
Star Chrome Case	1920	401	II	190	Duff																														
A.G. for Canada v. A.G. for Que.	1921	1	413	II	198	Haldane																													
Great West Saddlery v. K.	1921	2	91	II	212	Haldane																													
C.P. Wine v. Tuley	1921	2	417	II	238	Birkenhead																													
Wilson v. Esquimalt & Nanaimo Rly.	1922	1	202	II	244	Duff																													
In re Board of Commerce Act	1922	1	191	II	253	Haldane																													
Burland v. K.	1922	1	215	II	262	Phillimore																													
Rex v. Nat Bell Liquors Ltd.	1922	2	128	II	272	Sumner																													
Scott v. A.G. for Canada	1923	3	W.W.R.	929	Atkinson																														
Fort Frances Pulp & Man. Free Press	1923	695	II	302	Haldane																														
Montreal v. A.G. for Canada	1923	136	II	312	Parmoor																														
Brooks-Bidlake v. A.G. for B.C.	1923	450	II	318	Cave																														
K. v. A.G. for B.C.	1924	213	II	324	Sumner																														
A.G. for B.C. v. A.G. for Canada	1924	222	II	331	Buckmaster																														
Reciprocal Insurers Case	1924	328	II	334	Duff																														
Caron v. K.	1924	999	II	349	Phillimore																														
A.G. for B.C. v. A.G. for Canada	1924	203	II	355	Haldane																														
Toronto Electric Co. v. Spider	1925	396	II	363	Haldane																														
A.G. for Ont. v. A.G. for Canada	1925	750	II	378	Cave																														
A.G. for Man. v. A.G. for Canada	1925	561	II	381	Haldane																														
Lord's Day Alliance Case	1925	384	II	387	Blanesburgh																														
Brassard v. Smith	1925	371	II	395	Dunedin																														
Nadan v. K.	1926	432	II	400	Cave																														
A.G. for Que. v. Nipissing Central	1926	715	II	411	Cave																														
Toronto v. Toronto Separate Schools	1926	81	II	418	Cave																														

(1) - Volume of appeal cases
(2) - page in appeal cases
(3) - volume of Cameron's cases
(4) - page in Cameron
(5) - person who delivered judgment
91-a - introductory words of s.91
91-b - concluding words of s.91
A - History & objects of B.N.A. Act
- Nature of legislative power
- Abuse of power
- Interference by Dominion with province or vice versa

B - B.N.A. Act exhaustive
- Exterritoriality
C - General rules re 91 & 92
- Trenching
D - Ancillary or incidental legislation
E - Double Aspect rule
- True Nature of legislation
- Pith & Substance
- Possibility of future conflict

F	- Overlapping field - Dominion prevails - Concurrent legislation - Repugnancy or occupied field - Delegated or Conditional leg.	J	- Indirect or colourable attempts
G	- References & academic questions	R	- Severability
J	- Appeals to P.C. & leave to appeal	S	- Statute becomes law when passed
L	- Dominion companies	T	- Treaty powers
M	- Provincial constitutions	X	- General rules of Interpretation
N	- Validity assumes		
O	- Applicability of laws of England or France		

P R I V Y C O U N C

		(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)		SECTION 91														SECTION 92																			
							1	2	3	5	7	8	9	10	12	14	15	16	18	19	21	22	23	25	27	29	b	1	2	8	9	10	13	14	15	16	11	21	23	24
Montreal v. Harbour Commissioners	1926	299	II	425	Haldane																																			
A.G. for B.C. v. C.P.R.	1927	934	II	441	Haldane																																			
Luscar Collieries v. McDonald	1927	925	II	445	Warrington																																			
Minister of Finance v. Smith	1927	194	II	452	Haldane																																			
Royal Bank v. Larue	1928	187	II	455	Cave																																			
Hirsch v. Protestant Schools	1928	200	II	465	Cave																																			
Halifax v. Fair-banks	1928	117	II	477	Cave																																			
A.G. for Alberta v. A.G. for Canada	1928	475	II	484	Buckmaster																																			
K. v. Caledonian Collieries	1928	358	II	494	Warrington																																			
A.G. for N.S. v. Legislative Counsel	1928	107	II	498	Cave																																			
Tiny Separate School v. K.	1928	363	II	505	Haldane																																			
A.G. for Man. v. A.G. for Canada	1929	260	II	534	Summer																																			
Fish Canneries Case	1930	111	P.	1	Tomlin																																			
Edwards v. A.G. (Persons Case)	1930	124	P.	14	Sankey																																			
Erie Beach Co. v. A.G. for Ontario	1930	161	P.	33	Merrivale																																			
A.G. for B.C. v. McDonald Murphy	1930	357	P.	43	Macmillan																																			
Proprietary Articles Case	1931	310	P.	52	Atkin																																			
Sask. Natural Resources Case	1932	28	P.	69	Atkin																																			
Quebec Insurance Reference	1932	41	P.	81	Dunedin																																			
Aeronautics Reference	1932	54	P.	93	Sankey																																			
Toronto v. King (Fines Case)	1932	98	P.	114	Macmillan																																			
Martineau v. Montreal	1932	113	P.	122	Blanesburgh																																			
Radio Reference	1932	304	P.	137	Dunedin																																			
Lymburn v. Mayland	1932	318	P.	149	Atkin																																			
In re Silver Brothers	1932	514	P.	159	Dunedin																																			
Croft v. Dunphy	1933	156	P.	170	Macmillan																																			
Lower Mainland v. Crystal Dairy	1933	168	P.	181	Thankerton																																			
Consolidated Distilleries v. K.	1933	508	P.	191	Russell																																			
Provincial Treas. v. Kerr	1933	710	P.	207	Thankerton																																			
A.G. for B.C. v. Kingcome Navigation	1934	45	P.	223	Thankerton																																			
British Coal Corpn. v. The King	1935	500	P.	237	Sankey																																			
Forbes v. A.G. for Manitoba	1937	260	P.	259	Macmillan																																			
The Judges v. A.G. for Sask.	1937	464	P.	273	Rowlatt																																			
Labour Conventions Reference	1937	53 TLR	P.	278	Atkin																																			
Employment Insurance Reference	1937	355	P.	305	Atkin																																			
Section 498A of Criminal Code Ref.	1937	368	P.	318	Atkin																																			
Natural Products Marketing Act Case	1937	377	P.	327	Atkin																																			
Farmers Creditors Arrangement Act	1937	391	P.	340	Thankerton																																			
Dominion Trade & Industry Act Case	1937	405	P.	352	Atkin																																			
Toronto v. York	1938	415	P.	366	Atkin																																			
Shannon v. Lower Mainland	1938	708	P.	379	Atkin																																			
Alberta Bank Taxation Case	1939	117	P.	394	Maughan																																			
Ladore v. Bennett	1939	468			Atkin																																			
Lethbridge N. Irrig. v. Forresters	1940	513			Caldecote																																			
Debt Adjustment Act Reference	1943	356			Maughan																																			
Atlantic Smoke Shop v. Condon	1943	550			Simon																																			
Abitibi Power v. Montreal Trust Co.	1943	536			Atkin																																			
Canada Temperance Act Ref.	1946																																							

- (1) - page in appeal cases
- (2) - volume of Cameron's cases or Plaxton's cases
- (3) - page in Cameron or Plaxton
- (4) - person who delivered judgment
- 91-a - introductory words of s. 91
- 91-b - concluding words of s. 91
- A - History & objects of B.N.A. Act
- Nature of legislative power
- Abuse of power
- Interference by Dominion with province or vice versa
- B - S.N.A. Act exhaustive
- exterritoriality
- C - General rules re 91 & 92
- Trenching
- D - Ancillary or incidental legislation
- E - Double Aspect rule
- True Nature of legislation
- Pith & Substance
- Possibility of future conflict
- Overlapping field
- Dominion prevails
- concurrent legislation
- Repugnancy or occupied field
- G - Delegated or Conditional leg.
- H - Parliament's interpretation

I L D E C I S I O N S

- I - References to 1867, history or extraneous circumstances
- J - References and academic questions
- L - Appeals to P.C. & leave to appeal
- M - Dominion companies
- N - Provincial constitutions
- Q - Indirect or colourable attempts
- R - Severability
- T - Treaty powers

- U - Severability of Crown
- V - Conflict with international
Law
- W - Westminster Act
- X - General rules of interpretation

